ABSTRACT

Different versions of translations of the same source text can be published and republished by the same publisher over the span of years. The differences between the two translated versions can reflect the changing attitude and translation ideology of the commission. This paper examines and discusses the differences between two Indonesian translations of Doraemon manga series commissioned and published by Elex Media Komputindo in the early 1990s and the early 2010s. The study investigates whether there is any translation ideology shift over a two decades-period and whether the ideology adopted in the two translations implies any sociocultural or sociohistorical information. To that purpose, the study focuses on comparing the translations of cultural-specific items (CSIs) in both versions. The findings show that in some cases, the two translations employ different strategies to translate CSIs, with the older translations (OT) tend to adopt domestication ideology to some extent, and the newer translations (NT) almost consistently adopt foreignization ideology. While the shift to foreignization in the NT may reflect the shift of attitude and perspective of Indonesians towards Japanese culture post-World War II era, the domestication adopted by the OT can give a small glimpse of Indonesian sociocultural conditions in the early 1990s.

KEYWORDS: manga, culture-specific item, translation ideology, foreignization, domestication

INTRODUCTION

In the aftermath of World War II, imperial dominance by military force or colonization was no longer popular and was started to be replaced by hegemony through economy and soft power. The term “soft power” was initially used to discuss the ability of the United States to entice international societies through American mass culture (Nye, 2004A). The idea of
American way of life and value has been disseminated worldwide through popular cultural products, such as American comics and Hollywood movies. However, in East and Southeast Asian regions, a new cultural power emerged in the late 1980s and the early 1990s. This emerging cultural power surprisingly was none other than the country with historical animosity in the regions: Japan. In fact, the spread and consumption of these cultural products in the regions helped establish a new, friendlier image of Japan, especially among the youths (Otzmagin, 2008).

Different from its American counterparts which are often alleged as items of ‘cultural imperialism’, Japanese cultural products are perceived as ‘the non-nationalistic and non-dogmatic side of Japan’ (Otzmagin, 2008: 96). On a similar note, Shiraishi (1997) argues that Japanese cultural products, particularly comics and television animations in the 1990s, had been spreading the nation’s concept on various matters “often without revealing their Japanese origin” (p. 272). This was probably supported by the fact that Japanese pop culture products, such as animated series (anime) and comics (manga), were often localized under domestication ideology of translation. For example, Lent (2010) finds that manga publishers in Hong Kong and South Korea adopted such ideology, altering manga “to suit their own language and culture” (p.311).

The translation of manga into Indonesian and its distribution began in large scale in the early 1990s. The biggest official publisher that partakes in the project up to this day is Elex Media Komputindo (EMK)—a subsidiary of Kompas Gramedia Group. One of their first projects is the translation of Doraemon manga, which constitute as the object of this study. In addition to being one of the earliest Japanese comics officially translated into Indonesian, this study chooses to focus on the series for its cultural significance. In 2008, Japanese Ministry of Foreign Affairs officially named Doraemon as a cultural ambassador, after previously listed as one of 25 Asian Heroes by TIME magazine in 2002 and a culturally significant Japanese pop culture by Taiwan Society of New York (Tsukamoto, 2014).

Doraemon tells the story of the eponymous cat-shaped robot from the 22nd century who was sent back to the 20th century to help out a boy named Nobita Nobi using the future gadgets he brought. The comic volumes usually consist of a dozen short stories with little continuity between them.

While in Japan, the series began with the comic version written by the duo Fujiko F. Fujio, Doraemon gained popularity in Indonesia after the animated series version was broadcasted by the private TV Station Rajawali Citra Televisi Indonesia since 1988. It was only three years later, the Indonesian translation of the first volume of the comic was published by EMK. The series then gained even more popularity in Indonesia. This Indonesian translation was reprinted several times for years before a new translation was finally introduced in 2011 by the same publisher.

The new translation was labelled “Japanese Binding Edition”, referring to the right-to-left reading order of the comic, which is not the common reading order in Indonesia. This binding format was first introduced in 2002 by EMK through the translation of Samurai X comic, and it gradually became a common binding format in their published Japanese comics. Curiously, this format has only been applied to Doraemon series in 2011, and to date, it is the only series which has the “Japanese Binding Edition” label on its cover although there have been some old series also reprinted in this new format. The change of the binding format raises a question whether
there is also a change in the translation ideology adopted in the new translations published around two decades later. The study will also attempt to investigate any sociocultural or sociohistorical information that can be inferred from the translation ideology adopted by the two translations.

To answer such questions this study will discuss and compare the translations of culture-specific terms or concepts found in the older translations (OT) and the newer translations (NT) of Doraemon manga published by EMK.

LITERATURE REVIEW

To date, most research on Indonesian translations of manga in general, and Doraemon in particular, do not particularly address the sociopolitical or sociohistorical aspects behind the decisions made by Indonesian manga translators in translating cultural-specific items. Some previous studies have also been done on the methods, strategies, and procedures employed by Indonesian translators, both in general and in translating Japanese idioms (Wijaya, 2007; Nuraini, 2013; Elfayanti, 2015). The studies indicate that the Indonesian translators tend to bring the translation closer to the target readers. However, the studies do not discuss the NT, with one study focuses on the OT and the other two focuses on the special anthology or thematic editions. A study by focusing on the lexical equivalence and on the meaning components of the translations of Doraemon’s secret gadgets (Tumewu, 2015) also indicates the tendency to adjust the source materials to be closer to the target readers. Similar to the other studies, the study discusses the translation of special editions released prior to the NT. Discussion on sociohistorical aspects is absent in the studies.

Furthermore, to date, no research on Indonesian translations of manga that compares two different versions in general, not to mention the ones published by the same publisher, that are released in different years. The study that is most similar to the present study compares the translation ideology in two versions of Indonesian translation of French novel Madame Bovary (Rahmawati, 2016). The study found ideological differences between the two, with the older translation tends to adopt domestication strategy and the newer translation adopts foreignization ideology. The study does not address any possible contributing factor to the shift in the translation ideology in the two translations.

METHODOLOGY

Palinkas et al. (2013) argue that the adopted sampling technique should be consistent with the aims and the assumptions which are integral with the method applied in the study. Therefore, the data in this qualitative study is collected through document analysis and purposive sampling. According to Patton (2002) purposive sampling technique is the most effective technique one can adopt for identifying and selecting information-rich cases from limited resources. In this study, first, the researchers look for any choice of words, expressions or any other aspects that are peculiar to Indonesian and Japanese cultures in the Indonesian translations of Doraemon published in the early 1990s (in this paper they will be referred to as OT—old translations) and their newer counterparts published almost two decades later (in this paper they will be referred
to as NT—new translations). We limit our research objects to the first 20 volumes of Doraemon manga. The researchers then put the data acquired into several categories adapted from the taxonomy of culture-specific items model proposed by Brasienė (2013). Adapting the categorization suggested by Aixela (1997 in Brasienė, 2013), Brasienė divided culture-specific items into two general categories, namely proper names and common expressions, each of which is then further divided into several subcategories. The following table is the categories and subcategories adopted in this present study:

**Table 1: Categories and subcategories of culture specific items**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Subcategories</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Proper names</td>
<td>1. Personal names</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Given names</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Folktales and myths</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Place names</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. Brand names</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common expressions</td>
<td>1. Foods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Units of measurement and currencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Date and time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Pursuits and customs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. Ideophones</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Under the category of proper names, this paper first will discuss the translations of personal names of characters. The paper will continue with the discussion on the translations of given names, which cover the nicknames assigned to either a person or a pet animal, or fictional characters within the story. Next, the paper will discuss the translation of traditional stories or folktales in the two translations. Finally, the paper will then discuss the translations of place and brand names.

Meanwhile, under the common expression category, the first subcategory that will be discussed is the translations of traditional foods and drinks. The discussion will then continue to the translation of units of measurement and currencies. The third subcategory to be discussed is date and time. Finally, after discussing the translations of pursuits and customs in the two translations, the paper will compare the translations of ideophones in the two Indonesian version. Although the last subcategory was not originally listed in the model, “ideophones”, or sound effect, is an essential culture-specific item related to verbal convention that constitute an integral part of comics and must be taken into consideration by comic translators (Nobis, 2013). Therefore, the present study proposes to include it under the common expression category.

To identify the dominant ideology in the two translations, and to assess whether there is any translation ideology shift between the older translations (OT) and the new translations (NT), we refer to Shirinzadeh & Mahadi’s (2014) spectrum model of “Translation Procedures for Rendering Cultural-loaded Words”, which is an adaptation from Ramiere’s (2006) spectrum model.
SKOPOS AND TRANSLATION IDEOLOGY

A translation ideology is the guiding principle a translator uses to produce a good translation according to his standards (Hoed, 2008). Elaborating his point, Hoed refers to Venuti’s (1995) dichotomy of “foreignization” and “domestication” strategies. The dichotomy was based on Schleiermacher’s (1813) classical notion of genuine translators, which is “either the translator leaves the author in peace, as much as possible, and moves the reader towards him; or he leaves the reader in peace, as much as possible, and moves the author towards him” (in Venuti, 1995: 19). The two options reflect the two ideologies in translation practice.

When the translators decide to move the readers towards the author, they are translating the text more faithfully to the image, situations, and atmosphere of the culture of the source text (ST). In this situation, the translators would lean toward “foreignizing” the target text (TT). On the other end of the spectrum, the translators might decide to move the translation towards the readers. This means, the translators would attempt to make the TT and the information therein more accessible for and easier to understand by the target readers. In this scenario, the translators would lean toward “domesticating” the TT.

It should be noted, however, that a translation process is fluid and a single ideology is rarely followed exclusively during the whole project. It is common to lean towards foreignization on one aspect, while deciding to lean towards domestication on other aspects in one project. It all depends on the objective that is attributed by the producer to the text (Vermeer, 2000). This objective is called skopos in translation studies. This skopos is in turn decided by the instruction received by the translator—or commission. Often this is issued by the publisher. That is why, rather than making judgment on which ideology is the most or less appropriate, we prefer to try and understand the objective of certain translation decisions and the entire project, as well as the possible sociohistorical cause behind such decisions.

To better understand the acts done by the translators to translate translation units—or procedures, to borrow Newmark’s (1988) term, we will refer to Shirinzadeh & Mahadi’s (2014, p.2353) graph of “Translation Procedures for Rendering Cultural loaded Words”, which is based on the model proposed by Ramiere (2006). This model will also be used to assess the inclination of the translations towards one of the two ideologies.
The procedures stated above are, in a nutshell:

1. **Transference/borrowing**: translators use the ST form as it is, or simply transliterate or make phonetic adjustment on the ST, which is also known as ‘naturalization’.
2. **Calque/literal translation**: translators translate the ST unit in a literal manner, and this procedure is sometimes called as ‘through translation’.
3. **Explanation/gloss**: translators explain what the ST unit means, for example by using a footnote or by explicating or adding the originally implied information.
4. **Omission**: translators remove certain ST elements in TT.
5. **Neutralization/functional equivalent**: translators replace a cultured-specified item in the ST with another item in target language (TL) that is not loaded with any specific cultural information.
6. **Cultural substitution/cultural equivalent**: translators substitute a cultural-specified item in the ST with a cultural-specified item in TL unit that has a similar or nearly-similar function.

This paper will examine the translation procedures applied to the cultural-specified items in the ST by the OT and the NT, and how they may reflect the ideology of the translation projects in general.

**PROPER NAMES**

As defined in Merriam-Webster English dictionary, a proper noun or a proper name is “a noun that designates a particular being or thing, does not take a limiting modifier, and is usually capitalized in English.” This includes names of a place, a person or character, an institution and a product. Though usually intuitively translated, and even encouraged by expert such as Peter Newmark (1988) to be transferred directly, translators might decide to change a proper noun while translating an ST for various reasons. Newmark even agrees that should both the identity
of the name-bearer and connotation are equally important to retain, a translator could first translate the meaning of the character names in the TL prior to naturally adapting it as the new name in the ST.

PERSONAL NAMES

In the OT, some obvious domestication can be found in the names of side characters. One of the first personal name changes encountered in the OT is the changing of “Jaiko” to “Ratmi” in the story All the Way from the Future World in volume 1. The name “Ratmi” was uttered by Jaian or Giant—the character’s overprotective big brother—when asking who had made his little sister cry. However, the name change is not consistent since the name “Jaiko” has also been used in the earlier part of the same chapter. Furthermore, after this one occasion, nobody refers to her as “Ratmi” anymore. This can be assumed to be a relic of a former editorial decision to localize the name before the plan was scrapped, which was done to preserve the theme naming of the siblings, Jaian (ジャイアン) and Jaiko (ジャイ子), with “-ko” (子) as a diminutive or suffix that is usually used in a woman’s name.

In the story I Love Roboko, readers encounter Roboko (ロボ子), whose name is a compound of “ロボ” (robot) and “子” (“-ko”). The name is descriptive of the character, who is a robot girl. The OT changed her name to “Fani”, a common Indonesian feminine name without any hint to her robotic nature.

Ganko (がん子) is a friend of Jaiko that appeared in the chapter The Cursed Camera in volume 4. Her name in the OT is changed into “Ani”, one of the most stereotypical Indonesian girl names at the time. She has the same design and name as Suwa Ganko, a Fujiko F. Fujio character from the Perman (パーマン) series, which was also published in Indonesia by Kompas Gramedia group in the late 1990s.

Another one-time character with a localized name in the OT is the faceless Yabu Kouji (矢部小路) that appears in the chapter The Umbrella of Love in volume 12. The character is called “Aling Darma” in the OT and “Koji Yabu” in the NT. The name “Aling Darma” seems to be an allusion to “Angling Dharma”, a legendary Javanese figure. Meanwhile, phonetically, Yabu Kouji seems to be derived from the plant yabukōji (Ardisia japonica), and it comprise the kanji for arrow (矢), department (部), little (小), and road (路). The two names have no similarities in meaning or context. The name “Aling Darma” seems to be chosen as a substitute to give the character a grand-sounding name, as the character is allegedly filled with good qualities such as wealth, athleticism, and intelligence.

The last name that was domesticated is “I Gede Amat”, who is hardly a character. She is simply a picture with a name that appears in the chapter Girlfriend Catalogue in volume 18. Her original name is “Kabashima Dekako” (かばしまでか子), which contains the element “Deka” (“large”) followed by feminine name suffix “-ko” and “Kaba” (“hippopotamus”) followed by a common surname suffix “-shima”. Her name alludes to her picture, which is a girl with a heavyset build and a face that resembles a hippopotamus. On the other hand, her localized Indonesian name, “I Gede Amat”, seems to originate from a riddle or joke among Jakarta youths.
in the early 1990s. It is a combination of a common Balinese name “I Gede” and Betawi/Javanese name “Amat”. In colloquial Indonesian, “I Gede Amat” means “Wow, so big.” Using such strategy, the OT manages to preserve the one of the humorous elements in the ST.

In addition to Indonesian common names and made-up names, there are also some cases where the OT uses the name of Indonesian celebrity to substitute the names of celebrities in the ST. For instance, in the chapter Balance Injection in volume 20, the name of an Indonesian celebrity, “Titi DJ” is used to replace the name “Yamazakura Momoko” (山まさくらもも子). While the Indonesian name is a reference to a famous Indonesian singer in the 1980s-1990s, our internet search on the latter’s name did not result in any significant information on public figure with such a name. It is possible that the name is a made-up name or a parody of an actual Japanese public figure. The name itself appears in the story when the main characters reads a letter from a celebrity. While the name change did not affect the narrative, it can convey the concept of receiving a letter from a well-known celebrity to the target readers. On the other hand, the NT retains the original name with a slight modification to the order of the name: “Momoko Yamazakura”.

In terms of personal name, the NT makes no change to the names of the characters, except for the order of the names, while the OT inconsistently uses a more familiar Indonesian names in some stories. The shift from the domestication-oriented cultural substitutions done in the OT to the foreignization-oriented transference done in the NT may indicate the growing acceptance of Japanese culture among TT readers, although one might also argue that the reason may be merely to simplify and expedite the translation process.

**GIVEN NAMES**

In this paper, the subcategory “Given Names” refers to the names given or assigned to animals, in-story fictional characters, and any other nicknames.

In the chapter The Owner Resemblance Manjū in volume 12, the readers are introduced to Suneo’s pet cat, named “Chiruchiru” in the ST. Its name was written in hiragana, so the meaning was not obvious. While it does not seem to be a common name for a cat in Japan, both the OT and the NT replace the cat’s name with “Si Manis” (literally “The Sweet One”), which is among the most common cat names used in Indonesia. However, in the same chapter, there is a difference between the OT and the NT in translating the name of Giant’s pet dog, “Muku”. The OT replaces the name with “Hero” (most probably pronounced as /hero/), which some people in the target culture used to name their pet dogs, whereas the NT retains the original name “Muku”.

Next, in the chapter Ayaushi! Lion Mask! in volume 3, The story mentions three in-universe fictional characters. In the ST, their names are “Lion Kamen” (ライオン仮面), “Oshishi Kamen” (オシシ仮面) and “Okame Kamen” (オカメ仮面). It should be noted that “Oshishi” is the Japanese word for “Lion”. In the OT, the first two names are both translated literally into “Topeng Singa” (“Lion Mask”). This becomes confusing especially when the two characters’ names appear in one sentence, such as: “ライオン-仮面の弟のオシシ-仮面が登場する” (“Lion Kamen’s brother, Oshishi Kamen, appears”). The sentence is translated
confusingly into “Topeng Singa diganti dengan Topeng Singa” (“Lion Mask is replaced with Lion Mask”). The NT, on the other hand, is more successful to convey the information that the two are actually different characters by naming them “Lion Mask” and “Oshishi Mask”. It is possible that the reason behind the use of English word “Mask” to translate “Kamen” instead of the Indonesian word “Topeng” is that because English, and Japanese, names evoke the image of superheroes more than Indonesian names. Whatever the actual reason may be, the names in the NT reflects the foreignization ideology adopted in the translation project. The name of the unseen third fictional character in the chapter, “Okame Kamen”, is translated into “Topeng Perempuan Jahat (“Evil Woman Mask”) in the OT and “Turtle Mask” in the NT. Though the word “Okame” can mean “tortoise” or “turtle”, it can also refer to a traditional Japanese mask that actually depicts a pleasant female face. The adjective “jahat” (“evil”) used in the OT can probably be chalked to an incorrect research of the pre-Internet era. In addition to the previous reason, the NT probably opts to use English name “Turtle Mask” as a reference to the animal theme naming of the other two characters. Since the character’s name is only mentioned and the character itself never actually appears, it cannot be decided which one is the more accurate translation.

Another in-universe fictional character name translation can be found in the chapter Special Screening in Nobita’s Room. A comic book titled “Dotabata-kun” is substituted with “Kepala Ember” in the OT. “Dotabata” (“どたばた”) is an onomatopoeia for the adjective “noisily”. It can also mean “slapstick”, a genre of comedy. The suffix “-kun” (くん) signifies that the comic title is either a name or a nickname of a character in the comic. On the other hand, “Kepala Ember” (literally “bucket head”) may derive from the term “mulut ember” (literally “bucket mouth”), which is often assigned to a person who talks too much, and the large-proportioned head of the character on the comic cover. In the NT, the original name “Dotabatakun” is used instead.

Next, in the chapter Cologne of Heart in volume 20, there is a doll called “Maachan” (まあのちゃん) the ST. Both in the OT and the NT, the doll was called “Noni” instead. The ST name was written in hiragana, so we cannot find any deeper meaning to the name. Meanwhile in the TL, Noni means “young girl” or “young woman”. The term was usually used to refer to Dutch women of the colonial era by Indonesians. The doll in question is depicted wearing European clothing and having light-colored hair—which probably influenced the translator’s decision in renaming her.

Finally, the Japanese honorifics “Sensei” is used to address different characters in the manga. The word itself may refer to teachers, doctors, martial art instructors, or any other professionals or people of authority. The most frequent use in the manga is to address or refer to Nobita’s homeroom teacher, whose real name is never revealed in the manga. Both the OT and the NT assign the name “Pak Guru” (“Mr. Teacher”), adopting the way Indonesians address male teachers, to this particular character. However, when the word is used to address a comic author in the chapter Ayaushi! Lion Mask! in volume 3 and a professional artist in The 6 Million Yen Painting, the OT and the NT adopt different strategies from each other. While the OT employs neutralization strategy by using the word “tuan” (“sir” or “master”), the NT chooses to
borrow the Japanese honorifics by transliteration in both instances— a clear indication of the adoption of foreignization strategy.

FOLKTALES AND MYTHS

There are quite a number of allusions to Japanese folklores in *Doraemon* manga. In some stories, the allusions constitute an integral part of the narrative. For example, the chapter *Story Badges* in volume 3 revolves around badges that allow the wearer to experience similar situations with any Japanese folktales whose titles are written on the badges. Leppihalme (1997) divides allusions into two categories: proper name allusions and key-phrase allusions. This part only focuses on the translation of proper name allusions. In general, there are three possible strategies in translating proper names allusions in general, namely retention, replacement, and omission of names (Leppihalme, 1997).

We found that the OT and the NT employ different strategies in translating proper name allusions related to Japanese folklores. In the *Story Badges* chapter mentioned above, the OT employs various strategies, while the NT consistently preserves the Japanese titles. To begin with, while both translations retain the names of the folklores in translating “*Kachikachi Yama*” (*かちかち山*) and “*Shitakiri Suzume*” (*舌切り雀*), the NT does so by using footnotes containing the transliteration of the Japanese titles and their literal translations in Indonesian, whereas the OT uses the Indonesian translation only. However, the latter title, which literally means “*The Tongue-Slit Sparrow*”, is slightly altered in the OT, making it into “*The Heart-Broken Sparrow*” which lessens the violent-theme reference of the tales. Next, in another scene where the story “*Hanasaka Jiisan*” (*花咲か爺さん*) is referred to, the NT simply transliterates the Japanese title, while the OT translates it into “*Kakek Hanasaka*”, or “*Grandpa Hanasaka*”. The last Japanese folklore alluded in the chapter is “*Urashima Tarō*”. Different from the previous folklores, the OT erases any allusion to this particular tale. For example, not only the title of the folktale is not mentioned in the chapter, a certain character name “*Kamekichi*” (*かめ吉*) which alludes to the Turtle or “*Kame*” (*かめ*) in the folktale, is omitted in the OT. In addition, the “*Tamatebako*” (*玉手箱*) box, which alludes to the mystical box in the folktales, is replaced in the OT by “*kotak kue*” or “*cake box*”, which defines and spoils the supposedly mysterious content of the box in the chapter. The NT, on the other hand, uses transliterations of the proper names related to the tales of Urashima Tarō.

Another case of omission of allusion can be observed in the chapter *Horror Story Lamp* in volume 2, which alludes some Japanese horror stories. One of the horror stories mentions the name of Okiku (*お菊*), the ghost of a servant killed for breaking a precious plate of her master in a certain Japanese horror story. While the name of the Japanese ghost is mentioned in the NT, the OT only tells the ghost story without revealing the ghost’s name. Omission strategy in translating proper names allusions can be attributed to the adoption of domestication approach by the translator (Leppihalme, 1997).

Different strategies of translating proper names allusions are employed by the two translations. The OT mostly applies omissions and neutralization, whereas the NT are dominated by literal translations, explanations through footnotes, and literal translations. This constitute one
of the indications that there is a shift from domestication to foreignization ideology adopted in translating Doraemon manga.

PLACE NAMES

Our investigations to the data reveal some attempts to localize the names of places in the OT that are absent in the NT. The names of places we discuss here are not only limited to the names of the names of cities or regions, but also the names of institutions and landmarks that are closely related to certain geographical locations.

Firstly, there is a difference between the OT and the NT in the chapter All The Way From The Future World—the very first chapter in the series—in translating a general word “大學” (“daigaku”), which means university. While the NT literally translates the word into Indonesian “universitas”, the OT replace the general word into a proper name: UGM. The name used in the OT is an abbreviation for Universitas Gajah Mada, a well-known state university in Indonesia located in the Special Region of Yogyakarta. The use of a specific famous proper name in the pilot chapter of the manga may leave the readers with the impression that the story takes place in Indonesia. The word appears as a caption on a picture of Nobita’s consolation party for failing university entrance test, which may indicate the impression of the target readers’ impression on UGM in the 1990s: one of the best local universities with highly difficult entrance tests.

Next, in the chapter Nobita Runs All The Way To Kyushu in volume 18, all geographical places that are originally located in Japan are replaced by Indonesian big cities located on Java island in the OT. “Kyushu” is replaced by “Surabaya”, while “Hakone” and “Osaka” are replaced by “Semarang” and “Bandung” respectively. While the distances between each location in the original source and the OT is not the same, they all indicate the direction to which Nobita runs, which is southwest in the original source and the NT and east in the OT. In the chapter The Delivery Phone in volume 19, “Surabaya” is also used in the OT to replace “Hokkaido”, the location where Nobita’s aunt live, although in other chapters in the same volume the name Hokkaido is kept.

The OT also localizes the name of a fictional island “Yojouhanjima” (四丈半島), or Yojohan Island. Our searches in internet on the island, reveals that Yojouhanjima is a parody of “Hachijojima (八丈島), since Yojouhanjima contains the kanji for “four” and “half” while Hachijojima contains the kanji for “eight”. Hachijojima is a vacation spot to the south of Tokyo in the tropical Philippine Sea. The name is replaced by “Pulau Seribu” in the OT. The name seems to refer to any of the islands in the Kepulauan Seribu archipelago, a popular beach vacation spot in the Special Capital Region of Jakarta. Both places evoke the image of a warm, beach vacation spot. This substitution also keeps the numerical theme of the place name, with “Seribu” literally means “One Thousand”.

Finally, in the chapter The Around The World Quiz, the Japanese landmark “Tokyo Tower” is replaced by “Monas”, a tower located in Jakarta that serves as a national monument of Indonesia, in the OT. Despite being much shorter than Tokyo Tower, it still fits the narrative of the story, which focuses on the impossibility of a person to jump over the tower.
Although in many other cases there is no differences between the OT and the NT, the NT consistently maintains the ST names of the places in all situations, either by using transference or literal translation. The OT, on the other hand, replaces some places with other locations situated in Indonesia, the country of the target readers.

BRAND NAMES

There are also some proper names that are related to popular brand names in *Doraemon* manga and its Indonesia version. In the chapter *Special Screening in Nobita’s Room* in volume 18, for example, there is an instant cup noodle bearing a certain brand. In the ST, the brand is “Cup Noodle” with the font style that is nearly identical to the Japanese brand Nissin’s Cup Noodles. The translator of the OT replaces the brand name with “Pop Mie”. Nowadays, both brands are available in Indonesia. However, in the early 1990s, Indofood’s Pop Mie was the pioneer of instant cup noodle in Indonesia, which eventually became the catch-all synecdoche to refer to any products of the similar kind. This is most likely the reason why the brand was used in the OT, to make it easier for the readers back then to understand the product in the story.

Consideration on the familiarity towards certain brands can be identified also in *The Delivery Phone* chapter in volume 19. Here, the OT replaces *CoroCoro Comic* magazine with *Hai* magazine. The two magazines are of different types. *CoroCoro Comic* in the ST is a comic magazine which publishes comic chapters, one of which being *Doraemon*—making this a homage to the magazine that serialized the manga. Meanwhile, the Indonesian *Hai* magazine was a very popular teen lifestyle magazine aimed at teenagers in the 1990s. Similar to the Indonesian translations of *Doraemon*, *Hai* magazine is also published by a subsidiary of the Kompas Gramedia Group. This reference is absent in the NT as the translator chooses to translate the comic magazine into “*Majalah Koro-Koro*”, transferred from the katakana of the ST name.

COMMON EXPRESSIONS

In terms of culture specified items, “common expressions” cover a variety of items that is not categorized under the category of proper names and are not written with initial capital letters (Aixela 1997, in Brasienė, 2013). There are at least five subcategories to which the data we collected belong, namely: 1) foods, 2) pursuits and customs, 3) units of measurement and currencies, 4) date and time, and 5) onomatopoeia and mimetic words.

FOODS

There are many references to various Japanese traditional foods and snacks in *Doraemon* manga. One particular snack, *dorayaki* (どら焼き), even becomes a recurring element in the series since one of the most distinguishable traits of the titular character is his love to this Japanese red bean-filled confectionary. In the earliest OT volumes, this trait is downplayed by replacing the Japanese treat with different pastries that were more accessible to Indonesian
readers in the early 1990s. In the chapter Kobe Abe in volume 1, it is replaced by “kue coklat” (“chocolate cake”), while in the chapter Friendship Capsule in volume 4, “kue pukis” (“pukis cake”). Later, in the chapters Nobita in the Mirror and The Five Doraemons in volume 5, all references to dorayaki are replaced by “donat” (“doughnut”). The adaptation to “donat” is also used in the chapter Graphs Don’t Lie in volume 8. “Kue coklat” is a descriptive, catch-all term that still fits the color or shade of the paste-filled pastry in both the black-and-white pages and colored cover of the manga. On the other hand, “kue pukis” is an Indonesian confectionary which shares the pancake-like consistencies with dorayaki. While “donat” has minimal similarities to dorayaki other than the alliteration between the two names, it is a common treat that is popular in Indonesia even back then. The name dorayaki is never replaced with any other snack in the NT.

Meanwhile, in The Owner Resemblance Manjū in volume 12, rather than replacing “manjū” with another treats, the OT uses the general umbrella term “kue”. Manjū is a Japanese traditional steamed cake with red bean filling, while the Indonesian “kue” is a catch-all term for any confectionary or cake. Therefore, the strategy that is used by the OT is that of neutralization, which leans towards domestication ideology. Unlike dorayaki, this particular Japanese cake is still rarely sold in Indonesia at the time of this study. Nevertheless, the name “manjū” is used in the NT, further indicating the adoption of foreignization ideology in the NT.

Different from dorayaki and manjū, mochi is a Japanese traditional confectionary that has been around in Indonesia since the Japanese occupation in Indonesia in 1940s. Since its introduction by the Japanese soldiers, mochi has been adapted to local taste and ingredients, and regarded as signature snacks of Sukabumi and Semarang instead by Indonesians. In the chapter Story Badges in volume 3, the snack “kibi dango” (黍団子), an allusion to the treats in Momotaro story, is translated into “mochi” in the OT. Although the two chewy snacks originally come from Japan, the use of “mochi” in the OT can still be regarded as an application of domestication as it has been adapted and regarded as a traditional or signature snack in at least two cities in Indonesia. The name of the treat is not changed in the NT.

The last food item on our list is taiyaki (鰤焼き), a fish-shaped pastry with red bean fillings. It appears in the story The Wishing Star in volume 10, when Giant makes a wish to a faulty “wishing star” device for the snack. However, instead of the fish-shaped cake, Giant gets a tire (“タイヤ”, taiya) and a tree (“木”, ki), a wordplay of the name of the snack. The NT uses the loan word “taiyaki” and provide a footnote in the to explain the puns related to the joke. Meanwhile, instead of borrowing or adapting the name of the snack, the OT slightly changes the narrative, making Giant wishes for something large (“benda yang besar”) instead and highlighting his greedy personality. The translation fits more with the comical situation that happened after that, since tires and trees are large things. The omission of the traditional food reference in the OT can be seen as an adoption of domestication ideology. On the other hand, the preservation of the original food name along with its explanation --acknowledging its potential unfamiliarity to the target readers-- in the NT is a clear indication of foreignization.
UNITS OF MEASUREMENT AND CURRENCIES

The setting of *Doraemon* manga is the Japan in Showa era. The currency used in the story, therefore, is Japanese Yen. There are some inconsistencies in the OT in translating the currency. Sometimes it uses “Rupiah”, the Indonesian currency, sometimes it keeps using Yen. The NT, however, chooses to keep the “Yen” on every occasion. The reason is most probably the shift in ideology to foreignization in accordance to the growing knowledge of Japan among the readers.

The inconsistency in the OT is also identified in terms of the amount of the money mentioned in the story where Indonesian “Rupiah” is used. For example, in chapter *The 6 Million Yen Painting* in volume 6, the 6,000,000 Yen value in the original source is simply changed into 6,000,000 Rupiah in the OT. This also applies to the chapter *Ayaushi! Lion Mask!* in volume 3, where “240 Yen” is translated into “240 Rupiah”. In some cases, however, the amount in the original source is adjusted to a near similar value in Rupiah rates applicable in the early 1990’s. For example, in *The Underground Adventure* in volume 5, Nobita’s “10 yen” coin is changed into “logam 100” (a coin, valued at 100). Though the Indonesian currency is not explicitly mentioned in the OT, it is reasonable to assume that the currency was Rupiah, since it was changed from ST’s “10 Yen”. Furthermore, Indonesians often colloquially referred to the Rupiah coins as “logam” (“metal”) or “perak” (“silver”). Both 10 Yen and 100 Rupiah were the smallest amount of money that can still be used to buy something at the time. The amount was also sufficient as a child’s pocket money.

Other than the Yen, the Koban (“小判”) is also mentioned in the series. Koban is the currency Japan used centuries ago in the Edo period. In the *Story Badges* chapter in volume 3, Doraemon—while digging—mentioned this ancient currency because he believed he could get some old coins. The OT translated it descriptively to “uang emas” (“gold coins”), referring to the material used in making the Koban coins. Such translation neutralizes the cultural reference in the original work. Meanwhile, the NT keeps the old currency name, but explanation is given in a footnote.

DATE AND TIME

In addition to the more globally-recognized Gregorian calendar system, Japan also has their own particular calendar system. Firstly, in terms of year, other than the Anno Domini system—Japan also uses *nengo*, an era name that corresponds to the reign of the ruling emperor. The manga *Doraemon* runs in the Showa era, an era which began in 1926 and ended in 1989. Secondly, in terms of months, while a year in the Japanese calendar system also consists of twelve months, the names of the months is different from the Gregorian calendar. The months are simply called “the 1st month”, “the 2nd month”, and so forth.

There are some cases where the OT tries to convert the *nengo* system into the Anno Domini system, while the NT retains the Japanese calendar system. For example, in the chapter *The Day of My Birth* in volume 2, similar to the original source, Doraemon and Nobita, in the NT, use the time machine to go to the year “Showa 39”, which corresponds to the year 1964 of the Gregorian calendar. However, the year is changed into “1960” in the OT, which is most
likely an honest conversion mistake.

Related to the naming of months in the two Indonesian translations, we also found a case where the NT adopts a literal translation method, while the OT converts the names to their corresponding Gregorian months. In the chapter Ayaushi! Lion Mask! in volume 3, the original Juugatsu (十月) and Juichigatsu (十一月) are translated into “Oktober” and “November” respectively in the OT. On the other hand, the two months are translated into “Bulan 10” (Month 10) and “Bulan 11” (Month 11) in the NT, which are the literal translations of the Japanese month-naming system.

The shift from the Gregorian calendar conversion in the OT to literal translation and transliteration of the Japanese year and months in the NT may reflect the increasing foreignization trends in the Indonesian translations of manga in the recent decade.

Pursuits and Customs

This subcategory will cover traditions and other cultural items that do not belong to the previous subcategories. In this study they include, among others, songs, greetings or gestures, and cultural objects.

Firstly, there are many traditional or children songs referred to in Doraemon manga. In the chapter Melody Gas in volume 4, for example, Doraemon sings the song Hato Popo (はとぽっぷ). In the ST, the lyrics that appeared in the frame are “Minna de Nakayoku, tabe ni koi” which means “everybody be friendly.” The Indonesian OT applies the cultural substitution strategy by replacing it to “rasa sayange, rasa rasa sayange” from the local folk song. The change seems to be done for reasons of familiarity. However, the NT omits any lyrics and put instead a senseless sound effect: “jriing triing triing jriing”. Later in the same chapter, Nobita also sings the song Hato Popo. In the OT again substitute the lyrics with the Indonesian “rasa sayange, rasa rasa sayange”. However, this time, the OT adopts literal translation strategy by translating the lyrics into “Apakah kamu ingin ubi?” (“imo ga hoshii ka?”/ “do you want sweet potato?”) and “kita berteman dengan semua” (“minna de nakayoku...”/ “we befriend everyone”). The Japanese lyrics itself is actually an adaptation from the original song since the word imo (sweet potato) is used instead of mame (beans) used in the original Hato Popo lyrics, to fit the gadget used in the chapter.

In the chapter Speed Clock in volume 10, there is a reference to a song about New Year’s Day, “Oshogatsu no Uta”, which was changed into a song about summer holidays in the ST. In the OT, the lyrics are slightly changed without straying too much from the ST. The Japanese lyric “もういくつねると夏休み” (“How many more nights to sleep until it’s summer holiday?”) is translated into “Liburan musim panas bisa tidur sampai kapan pun” (“On summer holidays, (we) can sleep until whenever”). In the NT however, the Japanese lyrics is only transliterated from its ST form, appearing as “Mou ikutsu neru to natsu yasumi.”

Next, we found two interesting cases of domestication practice in the OT related to the translation of the Japanese phrase “tadaima” (ただいま), which is a phrase traditionally said when someone is coming home. The cases occurred in the chapters Changeable Date Calendar in volume 3 (uttered by Nobita’s father) and Change Your Face to Look like Someone

352
Else in volume 4 (uttered by Nobita). In the two instances, “tadaima” is replaced by “Assalamualaikum” (“Peace be upon you”), an Arabic greeting which is also commonly uttered when someone enter a house in the target culture. Interestingly, although it is mostly used by people of Islamic faith background in the target culture, which is the majority of the population in Indonesia, it is used in the chapter revolving Christmas celebration in volume 3. Consequently, this domestication practice may break the immersion of readers in the story, especially if it is maintained today, when celebration of Christmas by Muslims has been deemed controversial matter in Indonesia. This might be one of the reasons why the NT chooses to translate the Japanese phrase to the neutral “Aku pulang” (“I’m home”) in volume 3 and “Ayah pulang” (“Dad’s home”) in volume 4 instead.

Last but not least, a cultural object that appears often in manga, including the Doraemon series, is the teru teru bozu (照る照る坊主). It is a doll made of paper or cloth that is often hung on the house to wish for a sunny day. While the name literally translates to “sunshine monk”, the OT chooses to translate it using a functional equivalent “boneka penangkal hujan” (rain-warding doll) as seen in the chapters The Weather Box (volume 10) and The Weather Chart (volume 12). Meanwhile, NT uses loan words “boneka teru-teru bozu” in the former chapter, and the functional equivalent “boneka penangkal hujan” in the latter chapter.

IDEOPHONES

Different languages may represent the same natural sounds differently. For example, Indonesian language represents the sound made by a gun being shot with the word “dor”, while in English the same sound is represented by the word “bang”. The words used to mime the sounds in the real world are called “ideophones”, which can be further divided into “onomatopoeia” and “mimetic words”.

Japanese is one of the languages that has an extensive number of such words. In her study on the translation of Japanese onomatopoeia and mimetic words, Inose (2008) reveals three general categories of Japanese words that are used to imitate real or perceived sounds, namely: giseigo, giongo, and gitaigo. Giseigo refers to the words that imitate the sound made by people and animals, while giongo refers to the words imitating any other sounds in the real world. Meanwhile, different from the other two, gitaigo does not really imitate any real sound, but rather represents “visual, tactile and other non-auditory sensitive impressions” (Inose, 2008: 98). In manga, these words are commonly used to represent sound effects in addition to being used in conversations.

Different from the other culture specific items that have been previously discussed, we found many sound effects in the older translations to be more faithful to the Japanese source materials. In fact, there are many cases where the older Indonesian translations of Doraemon simply transliterate the original Japanese characters, sometimes with a slight change in the phonetic, and occasionally use them together with Indonesian onomatopoeic words. The newer translations, on the other hand, opt to use the words or expressions that are more familiar to Indonesian readers, with a few exceptions, such as the exclamation word “kyaa” that has been more commonly used to represent a scream by Indonesian writers. The followings are some
examples where transliterations of Japanese onomatopoeia and mimetic words in the older translations are replaced by other words that are more familiar with Indonesian readers in the newer translations.

People from different culture may perceive the sounds produced by animals in different ways. For example, while Japanese perceive the sound of a barking dog as “wanwan”, Indonesians will perceive the same sound as “gukguk”. There are a number of differences of the translation of some giseigo, or the sounds made by animals or people, in the older and newer Indonesian translations of Doraemon. For example, in illustrating the sound made by hatchlings in Time Cloth story in volume 2, the sound effect “pyo pyo” is used in the older translation, while the newer translation uses “ciap ciap” instead. While the latter is the Indonesian onomatopoeic word for the sound made by baby birds or chickens, the former is the transliteration of the Japanese onomatopoeic word for the same sound, “piyopiyo” (ピヨピヨ). However, in translating the Japanese onomatopoeia “ゴホゴホ”, which represents the coughing sound, in the story Transferring Cold in the same volume, there is some inconsistency in the older translation. The newer translation consistently uses the Indonesian coughing sound effect “uhuk uhuk”, whereas the older translation uses transliteration of either the Japanese onomatopoeia (“goho goho”), Indonesian coughing sound effect (“uhuk uhuk”), or Indonesian snorting sound effect (“grok grok”).

Similar cases are also found in the translations of the words representing the sounds made by inanimate objects. For instance, in imitating the sound made by horse’s hooves in the story Run, Bamboo Horse! in volume 1, the older translation uses the sound effect “pok pok”, which is most likely to be adapted from the Japanese onomatopoeia for clip-clopping sound “pakapaka”(ウマタケ) used in the source material. The newer translation, on the other hand, uses the Indonesian onomatopoeia for the same sound, “toplak toplak”. Another example, in Reversal Arrow story in volume 4, a floating balloon touched by the reversal arrow device becomes a heavy object, requiring it to be rolled on the ground. In the source material, the sound effect on the panel is “ゴロゴロ”, which is an onomatopoeia for the rolling sound of something big and heavy. The transliteration of such onomatopoeia, “goro goro”, is used in the older translation. On the other hand, the newer translation uses the sound effect “glundung glundung”, which comes from the Indonesian verb “gelundung” (“to roll”).

Using target language verbs to translate Japanese mimetic words, or gitaigo, is one of the most common strategies adopted by translators (Bartashova & Sichinskiy, 2014). We found this to be true in the newer Indonesian translations of Doraemon. For example, the older translation uses the sound effect “uro uro”, a transliteration of the Japanese “ウロウロ”, in the scene where Nobita and Doraemon are wandering around in the last panel of volume 2. Meanwhile, the newer translation uses the Indonesian reduplicative verb “bolak balik”, which literally means “going back and forth”. Similarly, in the scene where Nobita is looking around to avoid misfortune in Doraemon’s Great Prediction story in volume 1, the sound effect used in the older translation is “kro kro”, which is adapted from the original “kyorokyoro” (キョロキョロ). The newer translation uses “clingak clinguk”, which comes from Indonesian reduplicative verb “celingak celinguk” (“moving head right and left to see around”). A slightly different case for similar situation is found in the story of The Coward Adventurer in volume 6. Whereas the older
translation still uses transliteration for the sound effects “kyoro kyoro” (キョロキョロ) and “kyotto kyotto” (キョトキョト) in the panels where Nobita is looking around, the newer translation uses the sound effect “set set”, a sound mimesis commonly used by Indonesians to illustrate movements.

Indeed, not all sound effects in the older translations are transliterated from the original Japanese. However, many transliterations that are used in the older translations are replaced by the sound effects or sound mimesis that are more familiar to Indonesian readers in the newer translations. This indicates that unlike the other subcategories, in terms of the translation of onomatopoeias and mimetic words, the ideology shift is from that of foreignization to that of domestication.

CONCLUSION

From the data analysis, we found several cases where the culture-specific items in the ST are translated differently in the OT and in the NT. In these cases, the OT mainly uses the strategies of cultural substitutions, neutralizations, and omissions of the original culture-specific items. On the other hand, the translation strategies that are almost consistently used in the NT to translate the same items include using or transliterating loan words, applying literal translations, and providing explanations. This is especially true for 9 out of 10 subcategories that we observe in this study, with exception of the subcategory of ideophones. This category, however, has not been included among the culture-specific items in the previous studies. On this subcategory, which is more prevalent in comic text compared to any other type of text, the OT frequently uses transliteration of the original expressions, while the NT substitutes them with the expressions more familiar with the Indonesian readers.

Based on Shirinzadeh & Mahadi’s (2014) model, it can be seen that there are many times where the OT adopts the strategies that indicate the tendency towards domestication ideology, albeit the application is not always consistent. The NT, meanwhile, is more consistent in applying the translation strategies that reflect the tendency towards foreignization strategy. Therefore, it can be concluded that there is indeed a shift in the translation ideology of Japanese manga in Indonesia in the past two decades, as seen in the Doraemon series, other than the preservation of the original binding format and reading directions. Some possible reasons for this, we concur, include the increasing access and exposure to the global culture in general, and Japanese culture in particular, especially with the dawn of internet age in the late 1990s and the increasing influx of Japanese popular culture items to other Asian countries, including Indonesia.

The shifting ideology in translating Doraemon in the recent decade also reflects the shift of perspective and attitude towards Japanese cultural hegemony among Indonesians. Instead of being a possible threat towards what perceived as national values or identities that needs to be neutralized, the current generation of Indonesians has embraced the Japanese culture introduced mainly through Japanese popular culture such as manga, drama or anime. In fact, we believe that the inconsistent, or partial, applications of domestication in the older Indonesian translations of Doraemon —as one of the first Japanese manga officially translated to Indonesian language— also played a role in the initial introduction, and eventually approval, to the softer face of
Japanese culture, as opposed to the harsher face shown by the soldiers of the land of the rising sun during the era of World War II.

From this study, we also found that similar to other literary texts, which can function as artefacts that reflect various aspects of a society, translation products can also enable us to take a glimpse of the social and cultural condition of a society in a particular time and space frames. This is especially true for the translations that adopt domestication approach, as seen in the case of the older Indonesian translations of Doraemon manga, where we can obtain some sociohistorical information such as the then popular celebrities, brands, jokes, expressions, and monetary values in Indonesia in the early 1990s.

Finally, this study is expected to raise awareness that beyond the linguistic aspects, accuracy and acceptability, studies on popular text translations, such as comics, has the potential to reveal various sociocultural and sociohistorical information related to the society of the target readers. For the future research suggestion, it can be interesting to see similar research to this current study to be conducted in other countries which have the past sociocultural and sociohistorical ties that are similar to those of Japan and Indonesia.

REFERENCES


**DATA SOURCES**

**Old Translations**


357
New Translations


Komputindo. (Original work published 1980)
Inter relationship of Humanities Studies

www.irhs.ui.ac.id, e-ISSN: 2477-6866, p-ISSN: 2527-9416
Vol.4, No.1, April 2019 (Special Issue), pp. 337-359

360