AMARTYA SEN’S VIEW: AGAINST THE ‘QUIET TOLERANCE’

Ingrid Bernard
Faculty of Humanities, Universitas Indonesia
icblight@yahoo.co.uk

Abstract

When a local old tradition in a particular community has ingrained the culture of the community, even though it is not in accordance anymore with current development, the tradition keeps on conditioning the community to accept the tradition as it is. Societies who have long-established in old tradition concerning cultural norm are often conditioned on several habits that lead to injustice to women. Knowledge and understanding of the issue have raised many interesting and sharp debate within the community of women activists. The impact of the injustice in treating women, as community members, has made activists do some efforts to eradicate the injustice way of thinking. However, in general, it is difficult to change the way of thinking conditioned by old tradition that lives for generations, and it appears in the form of refusal that can lead to a real inequity in treating women within those societies.

Keywords: Inequity, justice, women, global perspective, social change

Introduction

“There is no chance for the welfare of the world unless the condition of women is improved.
It is not possible for a bird to fly on one wing”.
Swami Vivekananda.

Amartya Sen, an Indian philosopher is an observer of this problem and in some of his works he, among others, has conveyed that the problems faced by women in particular cultures are based on “evidence of the eyes”, these are factualities that have been happening in certain societies in India and in different regions of the world. The crucial problems that need to be addressed according to him is the way women perceived themselves as intellectually inferior than men. “...traditional inequalities, such as unequal treatment of women in sexist societies (and even violence against them), or discrimination against members of other racial groups, survive by the unquestioning acceptance of received beliefs (including the subservient roles of the traditional underdog)”. This mindset conditioning requires to be understood by women activists locally, nationally, or internationally, when performing observations on certain traditional societies to overcome the problems...
which have many layers, in the efforts to empower women by themselves. In another analysis of this issue, Biewener and Bacqué (2015) conveyed: “Social problems are understood as ‘rooted in structures that reproduce inequalities on a systematic basis’, and change can only come about through overcoming these structures challenges”. Their analysis also suggested to involve language, literature, and profession that can provide inspiration to women empowerment.

In the context of women empowerment, one of the examples presented in this paper is Biewener and Bacqué (2015) research in the cases of women empowerment in Asia, especially in India. Both said that women activists tried to change the meaning of women empowerment to what were actually required by women, which were self-reliance and inner strength, awakening self-hood and self-strength, or women strengthened to be themselves. Empowerment in this form is an alternative of empowerment from the old patern, which is making women as the recipient of what is necessary, or beneficiary, for example by accepting welfare-card and money, so that women may feel comfortable. Furthermore, Biewener and Bacqué (2015) explained that to deal with these conditions, it required a significant different perspective in the mainstream of thinking, in the way the empowerment should be pursued by women activists. Crucial issue regarding women who think that they are intellectually inferior as compared to men is the first thing that must be overcome. In his analysis, Amartya Sen gave examples of cases that there were significant differences in India in the levels of morbidity, and women in India often felt that morbidity in women was much lower than that in men. Amartya Sen’s comment on this quiet tolerance was: it appeared to be related to the lack of education in women and also to the social tendency to see gender disparity as a normal phenomenon. There is also a tendency in women themselves to take the systematic deprivation of their rights in various fields as normal. This mindset should be overcome, and this paper will present the inspirations from Amartya Sen, and also Biewener’s and Bacqué’s (2015) view and their comprehensive solutions to this problem.

The Quiet Tolerance

Discourse of women empowerment emerges in the context of a grassroot project to increase women's awareness. Terms like ‘alternative development’, ‘social change’, ‘empowering’ quickly spread in the international development community, so that in the mid-1990s they became keywords, and in many respects they were domesticated or normalized along the lines of economic and political liberalism. Women empowerment is fundamentally understood as a multifacet process that explicitly addresses the social power and inequality that enables social transformation on the basis of women self-organization. Since the beginning of the mid 19th century, the term ‘women empowerment’ has been used in the meaning of ‘invested’ or ‘authorized’ by higher authorities, and is seen as a process by which individuals develop their capacities to act and to gain power. The process is seen
as individuals' effort to develop themselves. Most of the applied terms in those realms are derived from the terms used in women’s efforts related to Non-Governmental Organization (NGO) in the southern hemisphere in 1970s and 1980s. In the mid-1980s, the discourse of empowerment emerged within the scope of the Indian government planning, oriented to “grassroots empowerment” for poor rural women, through collective reflection, participation, and self-organized groups. At the end of the twentieth century, the term empowerment has entered into the mainstream of international development discourse. According to Narayan Banerjee, the concept of women empowerment in India was a product of post women's movement in 1975. In the mid-1980s, the Indian government has embraced the organizational empowerment grassroots as part of the planning agenda for rural development. In the era around mid 1980 empowerment approach for development has emerged in the international arena through a network of the first women transnational as the Development Alternatives with Women for a New Era Project (DAWN).

According to Amartya Sen, what was crucial to the problems in women empowerment was the politicization of women's rights deprivation. This is well recognized by large organizations that deal with women’s problems, so the bias in the perception of deprivation of women’s rights has become less common. In the case found in India, although there are problems at the level of women’s high mortality, Indian women assume that their morbidity rates are much lower than those of men. As said before, what Amartya Sen declared as the quiet tolerance appears to be related to the lack of education in women, resulting in a social tendency to see gender disparity as a normal phenomenon. That also occurs in most countries of Asia and Africa, the tendency to not being aware of the systematic deprivation of women's rights in various fields. In fact, women in discriminatory traditional societies tend to be permissive to accept that their social position is lower than that of men. Through a long and arduous process, a better understanding of the problems, and among others, women's right of health services, have substantially contributed to the reduction of sex bias and women morbidity.

Comparative Perspective

To be able to understand the problems faced by women activists in terms of seeking equality, this paper will discuss one view from Amartya Sen on a comparative perspective, which is considered to be able to provide inspiration in presenting a comparison of the advancement of justice for women against injustice, slavery, subjugation of women, systematically neglecting health through the lack of medical facilities in some parts of Africa and Asia’s countries, or inaction on torture, and omission of chronic hunger. Several attempts to achieve amendment are intended to reduce the occurrence of injustice, although Amartya Sen himself argued, if all efforts that have been agreed are successfully implemented, the fairness of women's equality are actually still far from being achieved. He held that
it is necessary to have radical practical concerns above theoretical reasoning in analyzing the issue of injustice for women. The implementation of comparative perspectives through the application of global perspective is caused by some mistakes in the parochial ethical and political assessments. The mistakes can be analyzed with the help of the community or nation experiences of other countries to obtain a correct view. Women's perspectives beyond the countries’ borders are especially inspiring.

Problems that occur in a particular region or country in terms of women's equality and how the issues have been resolved outside the borders of a region or country can be an assessment in finding a fair solution for certain communities in other regions. In Amartya Sen’s view there are two different reasons of the importance of comparative perspectives in solving problems. At first, what happens in a country, and how the domestic institutions of the country work, can have a major impact to another countries or the world. Amartya Sen argued that it was quite clear when we observe how the world operations against terrorism were handled or how the country tried to overcome the terrorists activities. Secondly, each country or society, has a parochial belief that can be used as a specific occurrence or matter requiring discussion for the global examinations and scrutinies. The perspective of the other side can be critically deepened, and the questions that required to be considered in the observations and scrutinies can be expanded.

Besides those ways, the allegations that lie behind certain ethical and political assessment can be questioned with the help of experiences from other communities or countries. The questions of a sensitive nature that come from a global perspective can be an important inspiration for the local public discussions of the inequality treatment to women in the society. In conducting the examination and scrutiny, inspiration from others’ views is necessary, because the parochial belief can produce illusory understanding by taking improper positional perspective. When observations from an independent position produce understanding through epistemological, ethical, or political assessment, the position of the observer must be considered in explaining the observation difficulty so that a comprehensive understanding that is not biased can be achieved. Positional objectivity can play an important role in overcoming limited vision in conducting research on a disparity society with long formed tradition which results in severe women inferiority as its culture norm. Thus, the independence of the mind to understand the characteristics of the cultural disparity norms is necessary, to encourage women to overcome their inferiority.

Rationality

Addressing the above issue and to overcome it, Biewener and Bacqué (2015) expressed a requirement for the application of the politics of empowerment
to emancipatory vision, directed to individual and choice, not only as a rational, purposive, or effective aims alone. This is because, in general, at micro level, individuals are motivated by the instrumental promise, extrinsic rewards, higher profits, so that at the macro level, the empowerment projects required to be re-evaluated in the context of individual contributions to the efficient allocation of resources and economic growth. They declared: "Homo oeconomicus is put forth as the norm of the human, and all individual conduct is to be ordered by economic rationality". Furthermore, Biewener and Bacqué (2015) stated that the old pattern tried to solve the problem by converting political and social issues into the market conditions, which at that time, the ideology of Neo-Liberalism converted individual problems into market solutions. These actions have their impacts on the depoliticization of social life, that is the proliferation or multiplication of rapid growth, in which the norms of society and participation are based on individualistic responsibility. According to them, in a Neo-Liberal vision, empowerment is conceptualized to be purely individualistic with the ability to make rational choices. By maximizing utility, an individual receives benefit from the chances to increase self prosperity in a competitive economy market. Thus, the reality of Neo-Liberal world order is as the one being practiced by most people, that is an attempt to raise income by exploiting market opportunities. The ideology of entrepreneurship empowerment gives an understanding that economic process and action mean advantage of market opportunities.

In Biewener and Bacqué (2015) description above, Neo-Liberal vision can be seen as an effort to raise awareness and to develop the capacity of human beings to be able to reproduce capitalism. They quoted Brown that, “a Neo-Liberal citizen is a person who makes strategy for the benefit of himself among a wide selection of social, political and economic choices, and not individuals who strive with others to change or set these options”. According to Brown, the Neo-Liberal agenda are the constructivists project which tries to develop forms, and imitate the normative social structure of self-interest. Empowerment in the Neo-Liberal discourse of development thus becomes a proof and has impacted a broader shift in development policy. When empowerment based on Neo-Liberal policy has more emphasis on matters related to rational individual choice, efficiency, investment, free market, entrepreneurship, according to Biewener and Bacqué (2015), the emphasis on other framework, that is the Social-Liberal vision, placed empowerment in relation to governance, poverty reduction, equality, opportunity capability, and choice based on effective asset. The Social-Liberal perspective also puts focus on improving the “power on” in which empowerment is defined in terms of allowing the implementation of the effective institute or the power of someone to choose. In this case Biewener and Bacqué (2015) stated that the Social-Liberal approach was relatively similar to Neo-Liberal, both have an understanding that individuals and institutions have a common goal of improving the capacity of individual materially, socially, and/ or psychologically. Social-Liberalism fosters mentality based on individual ownership, and ownership is directed at seeking entrepreneurial opportunities.
Even when both visions are relatively similar, Biewener and Bacqué (2015) stated that the Social-Liberal vision is different from the Neo-Liberal vision in at least three important ways. At first, the ability to purposively select the option is not regarded as an inherently human attribute, but rather, in many cases, these capabilities require to be built; they include several elements in consciousness raising. Secondly, a Social-Liberal approach gives a wider and deeper consideration in the context of individual choice. It recognizes the role of both formal and informal institutions in establishing rules of the game and in shaping the opportunity structure. This approach also considers a “domain of empowerment” beyond the market, namely, those of the state and society. Thirdly, unlike the major concern in an efficient allocation of resources that marked Neo-Liberal approach to empowerment, Social-Liberal vision inspires egalitarian orientation that aims to solve social disparities caused by the inequality. As a reaction to the top-down approach in terms of women welfare and development through a Neo-Liberal approach, the transnational project which fights for social change has an alternative development vision based on a non-capitalist vision. This is a task for women activists to re-socialize economic relations by building new cultivation, non-capitalist economy subjectivity, practices, and social relationships. Biewener and Bacqué (2015) quoted Brown that in achieving their goals, women activists have to liberate themselves, to emancipate from production domain, to take a different path from the liberal democracy in the order of social capitalist economy. A major initiative of the activists is to change the mindset into a form that is more significant to achieve the forms of empowerment that allows the formation of subjectivity and agency for women empowerment.

Misinterpretation

Approaches to seek alternatives based on development vision to achieve social change is not always properly understood. Amartya Sen argued that misinterpretations might arise from a reluctance to distinguish adequately between individual characteristics used in the capability approach, and social influences on them. The observation of the problem has stopped too early before thorough observation was obtained. According to Amartya Sen, observing the individual roles of thinking, choosing, and doing is just the beginning of understanding on what is actually happening. The way of thinking, choosing, and doing of people in a society has to be observed, to understand why and how individuals of the society perform these activities in a social relations context. Amartya Sen added that the way to think, to choose or act of each individual in a society was influenced by its environment. A women in a society that is traditionally in discriminatory will accept that women are in an inferior position as
compared to men. Thus, the collective view of the individual under the influence of the social, is not independent of the social conditions in which she lived.

To change this view, the capability perspective, which requires more and relevant involvement to the subject is required. As an example, he revealed that it has been a general understanding that when health care was provided symmetrically on both men and women, women tended to live longer than men, with lower mortality rate in each age group. If there is a particular concern for the equality of ability to live longer, then the idea to provide less medical attention for women to overcome men biological weaknesses may appear. But reducing medical care services to women clearly violates the terms of a significant process of equity, and it is unreasonable to claim that in such cases, call for justice in both policy and process of freedom can occur due to the single minded thought on the aspects of the chance of freedom, including prioritizing equality in life expectancy. He also discussed the issue of obligation. Amartya Sen put a stress that obligations which were defined loosely should not be misconstrued as there was no obligation at all. These obligations are included in the category of important obligations by Kant referred as imperfect obligations, and that may be in line with perfect obligations. A case of ignored perfect and imperfect obligation was given by Amartya Sen through one of the fatal cases in Queens, New York in 1964. A women, Catherine (Kitty) Genovese, was brutally attacked and this incident was known by neighbors at her apartment, but her screams were neglected. In this case three distinct but interrelated fatal violations have occurred. At first there has been a violation of the right to freedom for women. Secondly, there has been a breach of the perfect obligation to respect the lives of others. Thirdly, a transgression of an 'imperfect' obligation in order to provide assistance to people who are facing assault and murder has also been violated. In Sen’s understanding, it requires more and relevant involvement to the subject.

Open Impartiality

To apply participatory methods, according to Amartya Sen, it is necessary to have independence of mind based on the perspective of impartial spectator, where the observation of women in other societies with more opportunity can confirm that women given the opportunity and the facilities required in education, have the ability to do more. He upheld the open impartiality which conveys the inspiration of Adam Smith methodological tools based on impartial spectator. This can be done across borders, without the requirement to operate collectively. Amartya Sen pointed out that the identity of an American female activist, an observer of the situation in Sudan as a fellow women, or as an individual (male or female) that was driven by concern to women, may be more important in certain contexts than the nationality. Their perspective can be seen as open impartiality. Another identity that may be applied, is to engage language, literature, profession, which can provide different political priorities perspectives based on nation.
Impartial spectator approach should focus on the relevance of the evaluation application in the society. The aspect to remember is that the application of an approach is based on capability approach, which means that the activists are not to assume anything, but to observe the circumstances of the society concerned as they are. When the level of the local belief is very strong and difficult to overcome, it can lead to a strong refusal to see that there is a real inequality in the way women are treated in their own communities. However, in Amartya Sen’s view, based on evidence of the eyes, the fact was, women themselves wrongly believed that they were in an intellectually inferior position. In other aspects of life, women are permissive to receive unequal treatment. In cases related to the dissonance on morbidity, the proportion of sickness or of a specific disease in a geographical locality, and mortality level between men and women, Amartya Sen said that women overall in India (as in many other Asia countries, North Africa, China, Pakistan, Iran or Egypt) tend to have a weakness for survival compared with that of men.

The mortality level was higher for women at all age groups, which continued to happen a few months after the neo-natal period, up to the age of 35 to 40 years. This biological fact would not happen if women receive symmetrically health care as men do. This sort of context requires to be understood by women activists when making observations on certain traditional societies. It is necessary to understand it with a transpositional understanding. Amartya Sen explained that women acceptance of the inequality that occur is one form of the quiet tolerance, the wrongly acceptance of the existence of social asymmetry and discrimination that can be seen in many traditional societies. In such cases, the idea of transpositional objectivity has a scientific contribution in conveying an insight on things that are not legitimate in the application of positional understanding. Biewener and Bacqué (2015) state that a proper understanding of the construction and the ability to implement effective alternative policies could only be obtained through the perspective of poor women in the Third World.

Emancipatory Approach

Social change took place in the era when the question related to the agency, subjectivity, and identity which appeared in its social and political landscape was then answered. The failure of the old pattern led women activists’ reaction, in some areas of South Asia in the 1970s, to the top-down approach of government welfare for women in development countries. An alternative that is put forward is the embodiment of a grass-root or the bottom-up vision, to advance women empowerment by the increase of women awareness. To respond to the liberal interpretation of women empowerment, the women activists should maintain their approach that real empowerment is the socio-political processes that connect
individual consciousness, self-esteem, critical awareness, and capacity building with collective engagement, political mobilization and transformative social action.

But, beyond the various approaches that have been applied, the question that remains open according Biewener and Bacqué (2015) is ‘what constitutes true transformation for policies that can give attention to women social position’? These questions or tensions are inherented in every women empowerment project. What should be considered in this context is to face the strong Socio-Liberal and Neo-Liberal understanding in thinking about empowerment in economic terms. It is important that women are not excluded from that region. In addition, women also have to understand the unequal and exploitative economic weakness in the Social-Liberal promise, and further to develop the vision and practice of empowerment of equal opportunity, women autonomy, and effective choice of assets in post-capitalist politics as stated by Gibson and Graham. The empowerment vision of previous concepts that offers various dominant course of Social-Liberal or Neo-Liberal which serves to reproduce exploitative capitalists relations cannot be denied; in exchange for that, women should be more expansive to articulate and mobilize communities, and build economic vision that offers the strength and support beyond micro-credit, entrepreneurship, or even a decent salary.

As mentioned before, the application of Neo-Liberal policies has aggravated women situation. A women activist, academic, and policy maker has written that at the grassroots level, women are familiar with or involved in macro-economic analysis and critique that shows how the practices of Neo-Liberal development has aggravated women situation worldwide, resulting in food crisis in Africa, debt crisis in Latin American, poverty crisis in South Asia, and militarism in the Pacific Islands. The same thing also happen to Social-Liberal vission, since both types of liberal projects, Neo and Social-Liberal visions are both above the subjective dimension of power and thus allowing the implementation of particular forms in institution and subjectivity. In response to the problems faced, Biewener and Bacqué (2015) put forward an alternative approach: women's emancipation or liberation, which is different from the Social-Liberal and Neo-Liberal visions. An alternative articulation is necessary, because if not, it can increase the intensification of workers capitalism, and it could amplify class exploitation. In addition, other efforts that need to be done is as stated by Brown: “women activists have to liberate the production domain if they still have a purpose other than liberal democracy in the social order of capitalist economy”. Biewener and Bacqué argued that radical openness is required that characterizes empowerment approach, and investment, in fostering critical awareness oriented towards justice and social equality relationships to create advantageous space to find ways in which women self-organization allows development alternative as stated in DAWN manifesto in 1987. It is the duty of women activists to re-socialize economic relations through re-producing and re-cultivating non-capitalist economy subjectivity, practices, and social relationships.
In the approach to alternative development for ongoing women's empowerment, there were efforts to fostering alternative forms of development as a way to women's liberation. In this method, attention is aimed at prioritizing the empowerment with critical comments about how to make this action brings significant changes in meaning and use. The approach to women’s perspective according to Biewener and Bacqué was developed in community-based activities in South Asia. On the other hand, women activists are required to address the institutionalized systemic structural forms of power and inequalities, where the process of women’s empowerment is aimed to overcome oppressive and exploitative social conditions. To negotiate this tension, women activists have to distinguish interventions that address women condition or practical gender interests from a more transformative interest that deal with women position or strategic gender interests. The strategy is no longer based on the authority of a large scale, but redirect the emancipatory based project. This relates to the recognition of local bodies and/ or individuals that in the realization of every social project, power is seen as an important element. The transfer to emancipatory based project reflects a common reaction to the large-scale authority, hierarchy, and bureaucratic institutions, and the transfer to emancipatory based project is a base for some visions of self-actualization and/ or self-determination. What need to be emphasized here is emancipatory ideal of women empowerment means to actualize themselves and to have self-determination. It is an agenda that shows the actions of the subjects to be responsible, independent, oriented on personal gain, and at the same time criticizing the legitimacy of the social justice claims based on rights.

Education

According to Biewener and Bacqué (2015) there were two things to note in women empowerment, namely the nature of local grass-roots and regional diversity and context. However, in general, women's empowerment is seen as a process that involves women self-organization in a way that allows them to mobilize, to achieve the effect of transformative social change in the subordination structure so that women can be free from subjugation. Empowerment process requires a new learning oriented towards achieving radical social change, namely critical awareness. This process also involves the establishment of groups or collectivity that have collective agents and social or collective identity. Women understanding of the empowerment emphasizes the importance of knowing and developing women’s identity and organizations through the process of increasing consciousness or awareness. This method is obtained through expanding ways and means of information based on social choice, that has been initiated by Kenneth Arrow. The same method was also used by Condorcet in the 1780s, particularly on women's education. Condorcet was the first person in this approach that emphasized the importance of education for girls. In addition, Condorcet also expressed the requirement for constant commitment in a public discussion, because
the information can be used in the public choice and in searching for social justice. It is one of the means to build a critical consciousness that is oriented towards justice and equality of social relations, creating a space that allows to find ways in which women self-organization can occur, as stated in Development Alternatives with Women for a New Era (DAWN) manifesto in 1987. The same view that education has intrinsic values to improve social and economic conditions in the Third World countries is also supported by Dreze and Sen.

Women empowerment will increase critical thinking, among others of the right of systematical health care services. This indicates the declining of positional perception about health. The improvement occurs through the increased of information in public choice, as well as increasing public awareness that women voice in public affairs is required. Amartya Sen argued that institutional reforms to achieve increased public awareness that women's voice is also required to be taken into account is required. Giving the parameters of behavior in a society is education, Condorcet's insistence on the importance of women's education is right. Education that educates behavior based on social justice and institutional efforts to promote social justice must be developed. Women's voice can play a role in public policy as part of improving fairness in the society, for the benefit of the direct and indirect consequences. According to Biewener and Bacqué (2015), it involves among other, articulation on three different dimensions. The first level is internal, psychological, or subjective empowerment in which a person’s "power within" and “individual-level power to” are developed. The second level, is the interpersonal and organizational one, obtained by growing "power with" and "power over”. The third level is the political or social one, where organizational and/ or structural changes is made possible through collective action. Briefly, the methods to increase the awareness, training in education practices as submitted by NGOs requires psychological transformation to develop a critical awareness and an “internal strength within”. Furthermore, social transformation or 'social change should be carried out by women themselves.

Challenge

Although women activists give emphasis on the social dimensions of empowerment and differentiate their approach in significant ways as compared to the old pattern approach, there are three things that pose challenges. With regard to the empowerment process, namely how to grow the capacity movement from "force in" to a "power with" collectively with "power on”. "Power within” to a collective "power with" and "power to. In this process, women activists require to pay attention to various strategies such as raising awareness, education, and community organizations.

The mainstream discourse of empowerment since mid-1980s, according to Biewener and Bacqué (2015) had not yet established a single framework. Although
women activists give emphasis on the social dimensions of empowerment, and then differentiate their approach in a significant way as compared to the old pattern approach, these methods are also facing some challenges. In relation to the empowerment process, its question is how to grow the movement from "power within" capacity to a "power to" collective. Indeed, women empowerment is a long process, difficult, and nonlinear because it requires persistence and long-term intervention to break the old patterns, to build awareness for women to respect themselves, to be independent, encouraging the development of new personality with a realistic understanding in addressing the function of gender in community and the strategies to modify it. In this effort, women activists requires various strategies to increase the awareness of the importance of education and community organizations.

**Egalitarian Orientation**

Concerns about the old empowerment pattern have brought inspiration to articulate a multidimensional understanding of the manifested and applied power and modalities. Therefore women activists develop a new knowledge and participatory methods, for emancipatory based project of women transformation, social and thorough experience of women's lives and aspirations, based on the previously mentioned definitions and social vision. In addition, women activists also contribute in shifting the powerful development of institution towards a more egalitarian approach that focuses on how institutional factors and social roles form effective agency of women empowerment.

Radical views on women's empowerment includes some individual collective dimension, and power structures; combines social vision of emancipatory or liberation and aims to encourage radical subjectivity or "resistance identities" to be able to pursue some kind of transformative social agenda. The approach applied is an approach that combines social dimension in relation with the purpose of empowerment process, in a different way compared with the the Social-Liberal and Neo-Liberal version. As noted above, the Social-Liberal or the Neoliberal vision is seen as a way to reproduce capitalist exploitative class relations. While the focus on the project here is to empower women to encourage activities that intellectually and politically are citizens rights in an alternative economic way.

Perspectives of empowerment with different conceptualizations put forward alternative politic along with a different conceptualization of the institution, subjectivity, and power. On this, Biewener and Bacqué (2015) conveyed the case where women activists contributed to embrace India government based on organization approach that moved rural women development by shifting the understanding of the government towards empowerment. For that purpose women empowerment explicitly requires to be defined as transformation of the social conditions to overcome structural, systemic forms, and/ or the institutionalization
of subordination, oppression and/or exploitation against women. Still a continuous critical women's rights activists discussions on their knowledge and understanding of the multi-complex problems are required.

Srilatha Batliwara, an Indian social worker and women activist writes that the radical transformation of society could not be achieved through a collective struggle of village or neighborhood women. To change society, women's empowerment should be a political force, which formed an organized mass movement and demanded changes to the transformation of the existing power structure. Empowerment should eventually lead to the formation of mass organizations of poor women, regionally, nationally and internationally. Women empowerment requires work at individual level and at the level of social organization, both national and international. The empowerment of women must be a movement characterized by the belief on the equality of all people at the level of political, economic, and social.

Closing

Those concerned about women empowerment argue about the importance of grass-roots local knowledge, along with the requirement to develop women self-knowledge and identity, but, Biewener and Bacqué (2015) said that knowledge without external agents were not considered sufficient to enable empowerment. External agents, independent women's organization, external catalysts, or intermediary agents are required to facilitate the transformation of identity and subjectivity, as means of enabling women to develop the capacity to make social change. But these efforts are not free from problems related to the role of professionals, experts, and intermediaries (NGOs) in the process of empowerment and how to deliver methods to increase awareness, training, and education practices function. Concerns about the role of an intermediary or an external agent arise, among others, because of different understanding of the subject referred. Women were seen as marginalized, oppressed, requiring psychological transformation to develop a critical awareness and internal strength within. The role of external catalysts are often very important in a situation where powerlessness is manifested as a lack of institutional and organizational capacity.

Empowerment is understood as a process of self-determination, so that the social change and how this is achieved should evolve from the empowerment process itself, or in other words empowerment is not something that can be done for women, but must be a conscious that come from the women themselves. Biewener and Bacqué (2015) stated that empowerment was a process which gave a sense of identity associated with selfworth and equality. Before women have equality in rights, they will not be able to empower themselves. An alternative vision for the advancement of women need to be implemented through the development of autonomy and equality oriented basic requirement for participation.
in the process of growth and development. Structural and systemic changes should also be made, so that inequality based on class, gender, and race can be balanced. This empowerment should start from internal subjective.

References


_________. Objectivity And Position. (1992), Harvard University, The Lindley Lecture, University Of Kansas